

## CHAPTER IV

### RESULT AND DISCUSSION

This chapter explains the result and discussion of the research. The first part is about what types of cohesive devices are commonly used by the students and the second part finds and discusses misuse the errors that used by them.

#### 4.1 Result

##### 4.1.1 Types of Cohesive Devices Used

Halliday&Hasan (2013) states there are two types of cohesive devices : grammatical and lexical. Findings show that the students could produce various types of grammatical and lexical cohesive devices in their writing. The students used type of cohesive device such as reference, substitution, ellipsis, and conjunction. Moreover, they also used reiteration and collocation. The findings cohesive devices are described in the following table 4.1.1

Table 4.1.1 : Overall use of Cohesive Devices

Cohesive Devices	Type	Sub Type	Number	%
Grammatical	Reference	Demonstrative	1183	60,89%
		Personal		
		Comparative		
	Conjunction	Additive	463	23,83%

		Adversative		
		Causal		
		Temporal		
	Substitution	Nominal	10	0,51%
		Verbal		
		Causal		
	Ellipsis	Nominal	3	0,15%
		Verbal		
		Clausal		
<b>Lexical</b>	Reiteration	Repetition	190	9,78%
		Synonym		
		Antonym		
		Hyponym		
		Metonym		

	Collocation		94	4,84%
<b>Total</b>			<b>1943</b>	<b>100%</b>

There are two type of cohesive devices, the first one is grammatical that consist of four type. The most frequently used are reference (60,89%), and the following are conjunction (23,83%), substitution (0,51%), and ellipsis (0,15%). The second one is lexical that consist of two types. The most frequently used is reiteration (9,78%) and the following is collocation (4,84%).

#### **4.1.1.1 Grammatical Cohesion**

Tanskanen (2006 : 7) argues that cohesion refers to “The grammatical and lexical elements on the surface of a text which can form connection between parts of the sentences”. Parts of grammatical cohesion are reference, substitution, ellipsis and conjunction. According to Halliday and Hasan (2013 : 39),” classify grammatical cohesion into reference, ellipsis, substitution, and conjunction.

##### **4.1.1.1.1 Reference**

Reference is the most frequently used in the student’s writing. According to Halliday&Hasan, (2013: 37), anaphoric and cataphoric references use personal reference or pronominal

reference, demonstrative reference and comparative reference. The findings reference devices are used by the students described in the following table 4.1.1.1.1

Table 4.1.1.1:1 Reference

<b>Type</b>	<b>Number</b>	<b>%</b>
Demonstrative reference	929	78,53%
Personal reference	180	15,22%
Comparative reference	74	06,26%
<b>Total</b>	<b>1183</b>	<b>100%</b>

The table shows that the students use all of those three references. The most frequently used is demonstrative reference (78,53%). The following are personal reference (15,22%) and comparative reference (06,26%).

#### **4.1.1.1.1 Demonstrative References**

Demonstrative reference is reference by means of location, on a scale of proximity (Halliday and Hasan, 2013: 37). The researcher found seven types of demonstrative references on students' writing. The demonstrative reference is described in the following table 4.1.1.1.1.1

Table 4.1.1.1.1.1 : Demonstrative Reference

<b>Demonstrative Reference</b>	<b>Number</b>	<b>%</b>
The	691	74,38%
That	125	13,45%
This	51	5,49%
Which	34	3,66%
There	14	1,51%
These	7	0,75%
Those	7	0,75%
<b>Total</b>	<b>929</b>	<b>100%</b>

These results show that the two most frequently used are demonstrative references “the” (74,38%), and “that” (13,45%), to follow are “this” (5,49%), which (3,66%) and there (1,51%). However the results point out that a few students used “these” and “those” (0,75%).

#### **4.1.1.1.1.2 Personal References**

“Personal reference is reference by means of function in the speech situation, through the category of person” (Halliday and Hasan, 1976: 37). The personal

category includes the three classes of personal pronouns, possessive determiners usually called ‘possessive adjectives’) and possessive pronouns (Halliday and Hasan, 2013: 43). The researcher found nine types of personal references. The items of the personal reference are as table 4.1.1.1.1.2

Table 4.1.1.1.2: Personal Reference

<b>Personal Reference</b>	<b>Number</b>	<b>%</b>
It	86	47,78%
They	47	26,11%
Their	22	12,22%
We	11	6,11%
Its	5	2,78%
Them	4	2,22%
She	2	1,11%
His	2	1,11%
He	1	0,56%
<b>Total</b>	<b>180</b>	<b>100%</b>

These results showed that the most frequently used are personal references “it” (47,78%). The following are “they” (26,11%), “their” (12,22%) and “we” (6,11%). Moreover, other personal references are rarely used by the students such as “its” (2,78%) , “them”(2,22%), “she” and “his” (0,63%) and “he” (0,56). And there was not only reference such as “I”, “me”, “my”, “her”, “us”, “you” and “our” in their writing.

#### 4.1.1.1.3 Comparative References

Comparative reference is indirect reference by means of identity or similarity (Halliday and Hasan, 2013: 37). The researcher found 6 types of comparative references. The following table shows the finding on comparative references table 4.1.1.1.3.

Table 4.1.1.1.3 : Comparative Reference

<b>Comparative References</b>	<b>Number</b>	<b>%</b>
As	54	72,97%
More	14	18,91%
Much	4	5,40%
Less	1	1,35%

Better	1	1,35%
<b>Total</b>	<b>74</b>	<b>100%</b>

According to the table above, the students most frequently used “as” (72,97%) followed by “more” (18,91%). Moreover, there were a few use of “much” (5,40%) ,”less” and “better” (1,35%). There did not find in using “like” “so”.

#### 4.1.1.1.2 Substitution

Halliday and Hasan (2013: 90) propose three types of substitution namely nominal, verbal, and clausal. Substitution is found in students’ writing. Nominal substitution is the most frequently used by the students. The total number of substitution devices shown in the following table 4.1.1.1.2.

Table 4.1.1.1.2 : Substitution

Type of Substitution	Number	%
Nominal	5	50%
Clausal	4	40%
Verbal	1	10%
<b>Total</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>100%</b>



The results showed that the students use of substitution is fewer than other cohesive devices. According to the results show that the students use of nominal (50%) is higher than clausal (40%) and verbal (10%).

On students' writing, the researcher found nominal, clausal and verbal. These are the examples :

- 1) *Relating to the case of mastering the pronunciation, many language learners have to face **one** other factor that make difficult in pronunciation. (Student C)*
- 2) *They find many differences in grammar, sound system and culture concepts found in English but **not** in Indonesia. (Student D)*
- 3) *In this case, the tense used is simple past tense. If they cannot **do** that, of course, errors will arise. (Student N)*

Sentence 1 contains “one” as a nominal substitution to refer to “the case of mastering the pronunciation”. Sentence 2 contains “not” as clausal substitution to refer to “differences in grammar, sound system and culture”. Sentence 3 contains “do” as verbal substitution to refer to “used is simple past tense”.

#### **4.1.1.1.3 Ellipsis**

According to Halliday and Hasan (2013: 143), ellipsis can be regarded as substitution by zero. It is divided into three kinds, namely nominal ellipsis, verbal ellipsis, and clausal ellipsis. The findings of ellipsis are described in the table 4.1.1.1.3

Table 4.1.1.1.3 : Ellipsis

Type of Ellipsis	Number	%
Nominal	2	66,67%
Verbal	1	33,33%
<b>Total</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>100%</b>

Among the four types of grammatical cohesive devices, ellipsis is the last produced. There are two type of ellipsis found in the students' writing: nominal (66,67%) and verbal ellipsis (33,33%).

These are the example of ellipsis on students' writing.

- 1) *English is an international language and the most widespread medium of communication, **both** because of the number and geographical areas of its speakers.(Student D)*
- 2) *Besides as means of communication, language has function as a tool to express idea, message, feeling and wishes of someone to other. That is why, all of human need a language for everything that they **do**.(Student M)*

Sentence 1, contains “both”. This word means the two nouns previously mention, “international language and the most widespread medium of communication”. Sentence 2, contains “do” which is a verbal ellipsis. It refers to “need”.

#### 4.1.1.1.4 Conjunction

Halliday and Hasan(2013: 238) adopt a scheme of four conjunction categories, namely additive, adversative, causal, and temporal. The findings are described as follow table 4.1.1.1.4.

Table 4.1.1.1.4 : Conjunction

<b>Type</b>	<b>Number</b>	<b>%</b>
Additive conjunction	343	74,08%
Clausal conjunction	84	18,14%
Temporal conjunction	20	4,32%
Adversative conjunction	16	3,46%
<b>Total</b>	<b>463</b>	<b>100%</b>

From the table above, additive conjunction is the highest (74,08%) among the others, followed by clausal conjunction (18,14), temporal conjunction (4,32%) and adversative conjunction (3,46%).

#### **4.1.1.1.4.1 Additive Conjunctions Device**

The researcher found nine types of additive conjunctions. The following table 4.1.1.4.1 show the findings of additive conjunctions used by the students.

Table 4.1.1.1.4.1 : Additive Conjunction Device

<b>Additive conjunctions</b>	<b>Number</b>	<b>%</b>
And	230	67,06%
Or	61	17,78%
Also	24	6,99%
Such as	12	3,50%
For instance	4	1,17%
For example	3	0,87%
Then	3	0,87%
Besides	3	0,87%
Moreover	1	0,29%
Furthermore	1	0,29%
In addition to	1	0,29%
<b>Total</b>	<b>343</b>	<b>100%</b>

These results show that the students used a variety of conjunction devices. The most frequently used is “and” (67,06%). This confirms that majority of students prefer using “and” to express addition in writing rather than other devices with the same function . Some other

additive devices used are : “or” (17,78%), “also” (6,99%), and “such as” (3,50%). There are three other devices that are rarely used by the students: “for instance” (1,17%), “for example” (0,87%), “then” (0,87%) “beside” (0,87%) and “moreover”, “furthermore” and “in addition to” (0,29%).

#### 4.1.1.1.4.2 Adversative conjunction

Adversative conjunction is also found in student’s writing even though only a few were used. The researcher found two types of adversative conjunction. The findings of adversative conjunction are shown in the following table 4.1.1.1.4.2.

Table 4.1.1.1.4.2: Adversative Conjunction

<b>Adversative conjunctions</b>	<b>Number</b>	<b>%</b>
But	13	81,25%
Although	3	18,75%
<b>Total</b>	<b>16</b>	<b>100%</b>

The students used only two types of adversative conjunction, “but” as the predominant one (81,25%) to

express the contrast which it considered easy for them to write. In addition, they also used “although” (18,75%).

#### 4.1.1.1.4.3 Clausal Conjunction

The researcher found four types of clausal conjunctions. The findings of clausal conjunction are shown and described in the following table 4,1.1.1.4.3.

Table 4.1.1.1.4.3 : Causal Conjunction

<b>Clausal Conjunction</b>	<b>Number</b>	<b>%</b>
For	33	39,29%
Because	26	30,95%
So	15	17,86%
Therefore	10	11,90%
<b>Total</b>	<b>84</b>	<b>100%</b>

The results show that a lot of students used “for” (39,29%) to express the causal. In addition, there are “because” (30,95%),”so” (17,86%) and “therefore” (11,90%) in student’s writing. There is no use of ” for this reason”, and “another reason” despite they mean the same.

#### 4.1.1.1.4.4 Temporal Conjunction

Temporal conjunction is also found in student's writing although only a few of students used it. The researcher found six types of temporal conjunction in table 4.1.1.1.4.4.

Table 4.1.1.1.4.4 : Temporal Conjunction

<b>Temporal Conjunction</b>	<b>Number</b>	<b>%</b>
First	6	30%
Second	7	35%
Until	2	10%
Finally	1	5%
After	1	5%
Third	1	5%
Fourth	1	5%
Now	1	5%
<b>Total</b>	<b>20</b>	<b>100%</b>

“Second” (35%), “first” (30%) and “until” (10%) are the most frequently used temporal conjunction. “finally”, “after”, “third”, “fourth” and “now” were rarely used (5%). No students used other varieties of temporal conjunction such as “first of all/ firstly”, “then”, “in conclusion” and “here”.

#### **4.1.1.2 Lexical Cohesion**

Halliday and Hasan (2013: 288) divide types of lexical cohesion into reiteration (repetition, synonymy or near-synonym, superordinate and general word) and collocation. In lexical cohesion, the students used repetition, synonym, hyponymy, metonymy, antonym which categorizing as reiteration lexical. Not only reiteration, collocation was also used in their writing. These classifications of them are explained in the following sub chapter.

##### **4.1.1.2.1 Reiteration**

Halliday and Hasan (2013: 288) divide types of lexical cohesion into reiteration (repetition, synonymy or near-synonym, superordinate and general word) and collocation. Reiteration devices are classified into repetitions, synonym, antonym, metonymy, and hyponymy. The most of frequently used reiteration is repetition. The findings of reiteration lexical cohesion used by the students are shown in the following table 4.1.1.2.1.



Table 4.1.1.2.1 : Reiteration

<b>Class of Reiteration</b>	<b>Number</b>	<b>%</b>
Repetitions	114	60,00%
Synonymy	27	14,21%
Hyponym	24	12,63%
Antonym	17	8,94%
Metonymy	8	4,21%
<b>Total</b>	<b>190</b>	<b>100%</b>

These results showed that students most frequently used class of reiteration are repetitions (60,00%), to follow are synonym (14,21%), hyponym (12,63%), antonym (8,94%) and metonym (4,21%).

The researcher found all of them in their students' writing. Repetition is the most frequently used by students. Repetition is which is simply repeated words or words phrase, threading to the text. These are the examples of repetitions:

- 1). *Curriculum has changed in patterns from 1994 curriculum to be 2006. The change of curriculum not gives improvement in education. Now, curriculum that is used is 2006 curriculum.* (Student A)

- 2). **English** is considered as a difficult subject for the Indonesian students, because **English** is completely different from Indonesian language (from the system of structure, pronunciation and vocabulary). **English** teaching involves of four language skills. They are listening, speaking, reading and writing. In teaching and learning **English**, there are four aspects that support four language skills above such as: grammar, vocabulary, spelling, and pronunciation that are also taught in **English** teaching and learning process.(Student C)

Students often repeated the same words several times. The words “curriculum” and “English” in sentence 1 and 2 are the examples of repetition.

- 3). We find that English is used in trade. In politics, English is used to communicate **the ideas** or **the opinion**.(Student A)
- 4). If the learner is inclined and able to correct **a fault** in his or her output, it is assumed that the form he or she selected was not the one intended, and we shall say that the fault is **a mistake**.(Student N)

Synonymy is used to refer to items of similar meaning. “The idea” and “the opinion” in sentence 3 are synonym. Similarly, “a fault” has the same meaning as the “mistake”

- 5). No language is intrinsically **better** or **worse** than any other.(Student B).
- 6). Most of the students still find problems in using it, because of their limited mastery, especially the differences between **regular** and **irregular** verb.(Student N)

Antonymy is the relation between items of opposite meaning such as better or worse in sentence 5 and regular and irregular in sentence 6.

- 7). *The media* using in teaching learning process of speaking were *white board, real object, newspaper, magazine, tape recorder and picture.* (Student A)
- 8). In its teaching learning process there are *language skills* to be learned by the students such as *reading, listening, speaking, and writing.* (Student A).
- 9). *Teaching process* that need *the teacher, the student, skills, attitude and good method.* (Student A)

Hyponymy refers to items of „general-specific“ or „anexample of“ relationship (Paltridge, 2012: 119). In sentence 7 ‘white board’, ‘real object’, ‘newspaper’, ‘magazine’, ‘tape recorder’ and ‘picture’ belong to the general category of “the media”. In sentence 8 “languages skills” is general category of “reading”, “listening”, “speaking” and “writing”. Furthermore In sentence 9 “teaching process” is general category of ‘*the teacher*’, ‘*the student*’, ‘*skills*’, ‘*attitude*’ and ‘*good method*’.

- 10) *The English 2006 curriculum is new supplement that need for education in teaching learning process of English. It purposes to develop knowledge, understanding, ability, attitude and students interest. So, they have skill and responsibility.* (Student A)
- 11) *Politically, education has been a perennial hot topic, because those who control knowledge have potential access to privilege and wealth. However, this idea that knowledge is some kind of commodity to be traded in intellectual market places known as schools and universities is only one of many characterizations.* (Student B)

In sentence 10, the word “supplement” is figurative language to refer to “knowledge”, “understanding”, “ability”, “attitude” and “

students interest”. In sentence 11, the word “commodity” doesn’t refer to the literal meaning as product, but it has figurative meaning as ‘privilege’ and ‘wealth’.

#### 4.1.1.2.2 Collocation

Collocation was a combination of vocabulary items that co-occur together. For example It includes combinations such as adjectives and noun. The students used collocation is shown in the following table 4.1.2.2.

Table 4.1.2.2 : Collocation

Collocation	Number	%
	94	100%

The table above shows that students used collocation limitedly, namely than 1%. These are the examples of collocation on students’ writing. It includes combination of verb and noun such as , ”make decision” and “solve problem”. In addition there are also combinations of noun and noun such as “international language”, “focus group”. And adjective and noun such as “white board” and “native speaker”.

#### 4.1.2 Types of Error Cohesive Devices Used

This part is to answer the second question that is to analyze how the cohesive devices are used on the Background of the study. The analysis are focused on the incorrect use of cohesive devices. In this research, the researcher found some errors in the use of cohesive devices in grammatical types in table 4.1.2.

Table 4.1.2 : Errors of Use Cohesive Devices

Type of Cohesive Devices	Type of Grammatical	Type of Error	Number	%
Grammatical	Reference	Addition	2	22,22%
		Inappropriate use	3	33,33%
	Conjunction	Writing mechanism	4	44,44%
<b>Total</b>			<b>9</b>	<b>100%</b>

There are two types of error :reference (55,55%) and conjunction (44,44%). Errors in reference come into two categories. There are addition (22,22%) and Inappropriate use (33,33%). Moreover, error in conjunction is wrong mechanism (44,44%).

#### 4.1.2.1 Errors in Reference

There are some incorrect use of reference related to addition and inappropriate use.

- 1). *As a language which is used by more a half of population in the world, English **is most of the most** widely use of international language. (Student I)*

2). It has been argued **that that** learning to write fluently and expressively is the most difficult of the macro skills for all language users regardless of whether the language in question is first, second, or foreign language. (Student N)

In the first and the second sentences, there are mistakes on addition. In the first sentence should contain only one 'the most' . In sentence 2 'that' should not be repeated.

3). Second, **Nugraeni** (2005) investigated about teaching process of speaking at SMUN9 Malang. The result of **this** study stated that.....(Student A)

4). Third, **Fauzi** (2002) investigated about the problems in the teaching and learning of speaking at the second year students of MAALMUTTAQUN Wates Kediri. The result of **this** study showed that.....(Student A)

5). All **these language skill** are related to each other. Alexander (1967) said that in order to be a skilled performer, the students should be proficient in language.( Student F)

The third, fourth and fifth sentences contain an error inappropriate use. The third sentence 'this' should be change into 'her' because it refers to Nugraeni. The fourth sentence should use 'his' to refer to Fauzi. The next sentence, there is inappropriate used of demonstrative language. These should be followed by plural noun. otherwise, 'skill should be in plural form.

#### **4.1.2.2 Errors in Using Conjunction Devices**

Errors in the use of conjunction also occur in the students writing.

1). For many people, Education is about knowledge: what it is, and how it is to be acquired by succeeding generations of learners, and thus by succeeding generations of humanity (Nunan,1999:3). Politically,

*education has been a perennial hot topic, **because** those who control knowledge have potential access to privilege and wealth. (Student B)*

- 2). *Writing is one of the four language skills which is very important to learn. As it know, writing is not easy. Among the skills, writing is the most difficult skill to be learnt, **because** it needs hard thinking in producing words, sentences, and paragraph at the same time. (Student D)*
- 3). ***Therefore** the researcher wants to analyze the errors made by the students and tries to give solutions to overcome their problems. (Student N)*

All of the sentences contain errors in the use of writing mechanism, namely the punctuation. Sentence 1 and 2 should not have comma before 'because'. However, a comma is missing in sentence 3.

## **4.2 Discussion**

### **4.2.1 Discussion on Types of Cohesive Devices Used**

The students used all type of cohesive devices. They used grammatical and lexical cohesive devices. Grammatical cohesive devices are reference, substitution, ellipsis, and conjunction and lexical cohesive devices are reiteration and collocation. Reference is the most frequently used by the student. Reference is used to present their idea in academic writing, so that the student often used it on their thesis background to refer to noun phrases such as the student, the teacher and the method. Moreover, ellipsis and substitution are the least frequently used by the student. They rarely omitted sentence items in their writing. In contrast, they often repeated sentence items. Ellipsis and substitution are less than 2% from all types found.

Demonstrative reference "the" is the most frequently used because the definite article refers to specific object in the earlier sentence. Because the major background is

teaching, the same as the use of reference, the definite article “the” was often used to refer to the student, the teacher. However, “these” and “those” are the least used by the students because they rarely identified the plural noun in their writing. The first person singular pronoun or possessive pronoun such as I, me, my, her, us, you and our were also rarely used by the student because the research/ writer hardly ever addressed himself in their writing. Furthermore, the students also hardly ever directly addressed the reader. Thus, second person plural pronouns was only used once. Interestingly in comparative reference, even though “so” and “like” have the same function as to compare, no student used them. They mostly used “as” instead.

Clausal conjunction “for” is the most frequently used by the student in their writing. It is probably because the students are more familiar with it than other clausal conjunction such as “because”, “so” and “therefore”. In addition, The student used only two types of adversative conjunction “but” and “although” to express the contrast. Moreover, temporal conjunction often used by student are “first” and “second” to express the time order.

In lexical cohesion, the students used all the types both reiteration and collocation. The types of reiteration are repetition, synonym, hyponym and metonym. Repetition is the most frequently used by the student. They often repeated words several times. For an example “English” was repeated five times in one paragraph consisting of four sentences. Moreover, metonymy is rarely found on student’s writing. The probable reason is that they are not familiar with metonymy.

#### **4.2.2 Discussion on Types of Error Cohesive Devices Used**



The types of errors that are found are reference and conjunction. Errors in reference come into two categories. There are addition and inappropriate use. In error in addition, students repeated words unnecessarily. For example, “*As a language which is used by more a half of population in the world, English **is most of the most** widely use of international language.*”. The sentence should contain only one ‘the most’. The probably reason is that the writer was careless in writing and, thus, it might be a typo instead. Moreover, there is an inappropriate use of reference, namely about the use of demonstrative language. For example “*All **these language skill** are related to each other. Alexander (1967) said that in order to be a skilled performer, the students should be proficient in language*”. There is no agreement between the demonstrative pronoun and the noun. “These” should be followed by plural noun. Therefore, “skill” should be in plural form “skills”. Moreover, errors in conjunction are mostly about wrong mechanism. For example “*Writing is one of the four language skills which is very important to learn. As it know, writing is not easy. Among the skills, writing is the most difficult skill to be learnt, **because** it needs hard thinking in producing words, sentences, and paragraph at the same time.*”. The type of cohesive devise used was correct, but there is a wrong mechanism. These should not be a comma before “because”.